Climate during the past millennium

Michael E. Mann
Department of Environmental Sciences, University of Virginia

To determine whether the twentieth-century climate change is unusual, it is essential to place it in a longer-term context. Since instrumental climate records prior to the twentieth century are sparse, indirect 'proxy' indicators are required for a description of large-scale climate variability in past centuries. The determination of annual patterns of climate, furthermore, requires high-resolution proxy climate indicators such as tree rings (e.g. Fritts 1991), laminated sediment cores (e.g. Lamoreux and Bradley 1995; Hughen et al. 1996), ice cores (e.g. Fisher et al. 1998), and corals (e.g. Dunbar and Cole 1999), and the few early instrumental and historical documentary records (e.g. Bradley and Jones 1995; Pfister et al. 1998) which contain seasonal or annual climate information.

A number of recent studies have employed global 'multiproxy' networks of such high-resolution proxy climate indicators to reconstruct spatial and temporal patterns of climate change and variability in past centuries. Such reconstructions include large-scale temperature patterns (Briffa et al. 1998; Mann et al. 1998, 1999, 2000a,b; Jones et al. 1998), multidecadal and century-scale patterns of atmospheric circulation and drought (e.g. Woodhouse and Overpeck 1998), indices of climate phenomena such as the North Atlantic Oscillation (NAO) (e.g. Luterbacher et al. 1999; Cullen et al. 2000) and the El Niño Southern Oscillation (ENSO) (e.g. Stahle et al. 1998; Mann et al. 2000a), and the histories of externally forced temperature variability (Crowley and Kim 1999; Free and Robock 1999; Crowley 2000). I review here the most recent findings in these areas, and implications for our understanding of past climate variability and change.

Large-scale temperature trends

Building on earlier, preliminary work (e.g. Jacoby and D'Arrigo 1989; Bradley and Jones 1993; Hughes and Diaz 1994; Mann et al. 1995; Fisher 1997; Overpeck et al. 1997), numerous recent studies have sought to combine multiple types of high-resolution proxy climate indicators in the reconstruction of large-scale temperature changes in past centuries. Jones et al. (1998) estimated extratropical Northern (and, more tentatively, Southern) Hemisphere warm-season temperature trends during the past millennium based on a modest number of proxy temperature climate indicators and a simple compositing approach similar to that of Bradley and Jones (1993). Mann et al. (1998, 1999, 2000a,b) presented reconstructions of annual global surface temperatures over the past millennium which are based on the 'calibration' (i.e. the construction of a statistical relationship over a reference period, the 'calibration period') of a combined terrestrial (tree wing, ice core, and historical documentary indicator) and marine (coral) multiproxy climate network against the dominant patterns of twentieth-century global surface temperatures. Averaging these patterns, they obtained an estimate of Northern Hemisphere mean temperature back to AD 1000, skilfully resolving an estimated 70–80% of the Northern Hemisphere mean temperature variance back to 1820, and about 50% back to AD 1000, based on analyses from both the twentieth-century calibration interval and an independent nineteenth-century 'cross-validation' interval (a time-interval distinct from the calibration period during which the reconstructions can be independently tested for validity). Calibration residuals (the differences between the reconstruction and actual data during the calibration period) were used to provide a self-
consistent estimation of the uncertainties in the reconstruction. Prior to AD 1600, the uncertainty estimates were modified to reflect potentially enhanced uncertainty in century-scale and longer time-scale variability relative to the nominal self-consistent uncertainty estimates with the sparser network available prior to AD 1600 (see Mann et al. 1999). Since the instrumental data used for calibration are themselves quite sparse poleward of the Southern Hemisphere tropics (see Mann et al. 1998), estimates of global mean temperature in past centuries are necessarily more tentative. However, to the extent that such estimates are possible over the past few centuries, they show a broadly similar trend to that for the Northern Hemisphere (Mann et al. 2000b).

The Northern Hemisphere mean reconstruction of Mann et al. (1999) is shown in Fig. 1. The reconstruction exhibits a modest irregular long-term cooling from AD 1000 to around 1900, followed by an abrupt warming during the twentieth century. The uncertainties expand considerably prior to AD 1600 as discussed above. Taking into account these substantial uncertainties, it can nonetheless be concluded that the decade of the 1990s (nearly a 2 standard error positive outlier relative to all other decades in the reconstruction) and the year 1998 (nearly a 2.5 standard error positive outlier relative to all other years) are probably the warmest decade and year respectively of the millennium.

The Northern Hemisphere temperature reconstructions of Jones et al. (1998), and Mann et al. (1999) are compared in Fig. 2, along with an entirely independent (extratropical, warm-season) tree-rim density-based Northern Hemisphere temperature estimate of Briffa (2000). The uncertainties for the smoothed Mann et al. series are shown for comparison. Statistically significant differences between the different temperature reconstructions are evident during the seventeenth and early nineteenth centuries. These are probably associated with the different latitudinal and seasonal sampling contributing to the different estimates. The Mann et al. surface temperature reconstruction, averaged only over the extratropical (30–70°N) region of the Northern Hemisphere, for example, shows greater similarity to the Jones et al. reconstruction (Fig. 2), though residual differences remain which are probably associated with different seasonal emphases of the two estimates. These differences emphasise the importance of considering regional and seasonal distinctions when characterising climate changes in past centuries. Such distinctions are further discussed in the next section.

Estimates of past ground surface temperatures from networks of boreholes have also been used to reconstruct hemispheric and global terrestrial temperature trends in past centuries (e.g. Huang et al. 2000). These estimates suggest even lower Northern Hemisphere mean temperatures in the sixteenth-eighteenth centuries or, equivalently, greater warming during the past two centuries, than is indicated above. However, a number of factors may complicate such a direct comparison with borehole-based ground surface temperature trends. The borehole estimates are associated with a significant loss of temporal resolution back in time, so that important century-scale temperature changes may be smoothed over in past centuries. Moreover, ground surface temperatures may be insulated from winter surface air temperature changes by seasonal snow-cover in extratropical regions, and such seasonal snow-cover may itself exhibit significant changes over time. Perhaps most important, a significant component of the enhanced warming evident in the borehole data may be due to anthropogenic land-usage changes which change the radiative and thermal properties of the ground surface, rather than any actual warming of surface air temperatures (see Mann 2000). In support of this argument, Skinner and Majorowicz (1999) show that ground temperature warming as measured by boreholes exceeds by more than 2 degC the instrumentally recorded surface air warming over substantial portions of North America – regions which in fact dominate the borehole network used by Huang et al. (2000). I investigate the implications of assuming that land-usage changes are responsible for (i) 0.5 degC, (ii) 0.75 degC, and (iii) 1.0 degC of the Northern Hemisphere mean ground temperature warming trend as estimated by Huang et al. (2000) (Fig. 3). The borehole-estimated
ground surface temperature trend over the past few centuries is seen to be consistent with the Mann et al. temperature trend (based on averaging the Mann et al. surface temperature reconstructions only over the terrestrial regions of the Northern Hemisphere for an appropriate comparison) if the mid-range value of 0.75 degC warming due to land-usage changes is assumed. The remaining discrepancy during the nineteenth century might be attributed to the fact that the abrupt early twentieth-century warming is split between the nineteenth and twentieth centuries in the parametrization of century-long trends used by Huang et al. (2000).

The terms 'Little Ice Age' and 'Medieval Warm Period' have conventionally been used to describe past inferred climate anomalies in Europe and neighbouring regions (see Lamb 1965). The timing of cold and warm periods in past centuries, however, has been demonstrated to be highly regionally variable based on more globally expansive data (Bradley and Jones 1993; Hughes and Diaz 1994) than were available to Lamb (1965). Regional anomalies thus tend to cancel out in a hemispheric average, leading to muted temperature changes in hemispheric mean temperature. The analyses of Mann et al. (1998) and Jones et al. (1998), which incorporate globally extensive data, and objective statistical methods for averaging these data, both indicate that the fifteenth–nineteenth centuries were the coldest of the millennium for the Northern Hemisphere on the whole. However, if defined as a large-scale event, the Little Ice Age is observed to represent only a modest cooling of the Northern Hemisphere from the mid-fifteenth to the late nineteenth century of less than 1 degC relative to modern (typical late twentieth-century) levels. Likewise, the Medieval Warm Period, if it is applied to the interval spanning the eleventh–fourteenth centuries, describes a period during which Northern Hemisphere mean temperatures only occasionally breached early-to-mid twentieth-century levels. Using yet a different mix of proxy temperature indicators (including those which do not have annual or seasonal resolution), and a simple compositing approach, Crowley and Lowery (2000) reach the very similar conclusion that Medieval temperatures were almost certainly not higher than the mid-to-latter twentieth century at the hemispheric scale.

Regional cold and warm episodes appear to have been more pronounced. The moderate hemispheric coldness of the seventeenth century was largely reflective of cold conditions in Eurasia, while the moderately cold hemispheric conditions in the nineteenth century were most directly associated with dramatically colder conditions in the North American continent (see Jones et al. 1998; Mann et al. 2000b). For example, while the nineteenth century appears to have been approximately 0.6–0.7 degC colder than the latter decades of the twentieth century in the hemispheric mean, the coldest decades for the North American continent were closer to 1.5 degC colder (Mann et al. 2000b). Medieval warmth appears, in large part, to have been restricted to areas in and neighbouring the North Atlantic which may exhibit a strong regional pattern or 'overprint' related to ocean-circulation-related climate variability, as discussed further below.

Patterns of atmospheric circulation and drought

The considerable variability in the timing, magnitude, and sign of temperature changes in past centuries in different regions of the Northern Hemisphere and globe can be interpreted in terms of regional temperature overprints due to changes in patterns of atmospheric circulation. Indeed, much of the regional variability evident in the Northern Hemisphere during the Little Ice Age and Medieval Warm Period of Europe can be understood in terms of changes in the North Atlantic Oscillation. For example, a distinct onset of Little Ice Age conditions of the fifteenth century is evident in measures of atmospheric circulation patterns of the North Atlantic, such as a 'polar atmospheric circulation' index determined from ice-core chemical species measurements (O'Brien et al. 1995). The influence of such regional atmospheric circulation anomalies on Europe underscores why it is perilous to extrapolate information regarding early European climate conditions to the hemispheric, let alone global, scale.
The year without a summer,' 1816, a cold year for the Northern Hemisphere in general (see Mann et al. 1998, 2000b), nonetheless shows strong regional overprints (Fig. 4, back cover) consistent with the North Atlantic Oscillation (NAO). As expected, these overprints are clearest, as shown, during the cold season. While the coldest year overall in Europe, 1838, was indeed one of the coldest over much of the Northern Hemisphere (the late 1830s were generally quite cold, perhaps due to the effects of the large volcanic eruption in Coseguina, Nicaragua, during 1835 – see Mann et al. 1998, 2000b), conditions were nonetheless relatively mild over significant portions of Greenland and Alaska. Unusually cold, dry winters in central Europe (e.g. 1–2 degC below normal during the late seventeenth century) appear to have been associated with the flow of continental air from the northeast (Pfister 1999). Such conditions are consistent with the negative phase of the NAO (Luterbacher et al. 1999). Warmer than normal winters in Europe and lower than normal temperatures in Greenland tend to arise during the opposite phase of the NAO. The Bermuda rise sediment core record of Keigwin (1996) suggests warm Medieval conditions and cold seventeenth to nineteenth-century conditions in the Sargasso Sea of the tropical North Atlantic. A sediment record just south of Newfoundland (Keigwin and Pickart 1999), in contrast, indicates opposite, cold Medieval, and warm sixteenth-to-nineteenth-century upper-ocean temperatures. Keigwin and Pickart (1999) infer these temperature contrasts as being associated with changes in ocean currents in the North Atlantic, and argue that the Little Ice Age and Medieval Warm Period in the Atlantic may in large part be manifestations of century-scale changes in the NAO. There is also evidence, however, that basin-scale changes in North Atlantic sea surface temperatures distinct from the NAO (DeMenocal et al. 2000) may also play a role in these changes. Black et al. (1999) emphasise the persistence of decadal tropical Atlantic variability in past centuries, while Delworth and Mann (2000) highlight (see also Kerr 2000) the importance of an intrinsic multidecadal mode of North Atlantic climate variability related to the thermohaline circulation of the ocean on past climate changes in the North Atlantic sector (see also Mann et al. 1995). Such patterns, and possible relationships with forced climate variability, are discussed below.

Changes in atmospheric circulation patterns such as the NAO and, over the North American sector, the Pacific–North American pattern, can be inferred as having a direct association with changes in patterns of continental precipitation and drought in past centuries. Much of the recent research using proxy evidence to reconstruct past patterns of drought has emphasised the North American region (e.g. Cook et al. 1999). One important conclusion from such recent work is that the range of drought variability observed during the twentieth century (including the dust bowl epoch of mid twentieth-century North America) may not be representative of an even larger range of drought evident in past centuries (Laird et al. 1996; Verschuren et al. 2000; Woodhouse and Overpeck 1998). Hughes and Graumlich (1996) and Hughes and Funkhouser (1999) provide evidence of multidecadal periods of pronounced drought in the western Great Basin of North America in the tenth to fourteenth centuries, while Swetnam and Betancourt (1998) argue that recent spring wetness in the American Southwest is greater than that observed in at least 1000 years. There is also evidence of significant changes in regional hydroclimatic patterns in South America in past centuries (Stine 1994; Thompson 1996). The relationship with such past changes in regional drought and precipitation patterns, and large-scale atmospheric circulation patterns associated with ENSO is an area of active current research (e.g. Cole and Cook 1998). It is evident, for example, that regions such as equatorial east Africa, which are currently influenced by ENSO, have undergone significant changes in drought/wetness during the past 1000 years (Verschuren et al. 2000). In addition, multidecadal modulation of atmospheric circulation, and drought in North America (Woodhouse and Overpeck 1998) may be associated with the impacts of a significant pattern of multidecadal climate variability originating in the North Atlantic sector (Delworth and Mann 2000), as discussed
below.

ENSO

Multiproxy-based reconstructions of the behaviour of ENSO have recently been attempted for the past few centuries, including a boreal winter season Southern Oscillation Index reconstruction based on highly ENSO-sensitive tree-ring indicators (Stahle et al. 1998) and a multiproxy-based reconstruction of the boreal cold season (October–March) Niño3 index (Mann et al. 2000b). There is evidence of substantial multidecadal changes in past centuries of the amplitude and frequency characteristics of ENSO (Stahle et al. 1998; Mann et al. 2000b) as well as in the extratropical teleconnections of ENSO (Cole and Cook 1998; Mann et al. 2000b). Figure 5 compares the behaviour in the Stahle et al. (1998) and Mann et al. (2000b) reconstructions with the instrumental record. While the estimated uncertainties in these series are, as shown, substantial, both series suggest that certain very large recent events (i.e. the 1982/83 and 1997/98 warm events) are outside of the estimated range of variability of the past few centuries. These recent changes in ENSO, if anthropogenic in nature (e.g. Timmermann et al. 1999), may have more dramatic impacts on regional temperature and precipitation patterns than any associated mean large-scale warming.

Forced variability

Recent studies invoking statistical comparisons of reconstructions of surface temperature with time-series estimates of natural (solar and volcanic) radiative forcing during past centuries (e.g. Lean et al. 1995; Overpeck et al. 1997; Mann et al. 1998; Damon and Peristykh 1999; Crowley and Kim 1996) find that both solar and volcanic influences have had a detectable influence on large-scale temperature in past centuries. Similar conclusions have been reached in studies that have used these forcing time-series to drive energy balance models (EBMs), producing surface temperature estimates that can be compared to empirical temperature reconstructions (Crowley and Kim 1999; Free and Robock 1999; Crowley 2000). Using such an EBM simulation, Crowley (2000) has shown that between 40 and 60% of the low-frequency variability in the Northern Hemisphere temperature reconstructions of both Mann et al. (1999) and Crowley and Lowery (2000) can be explained in terms of the response to a combination of natural and anthropogenic forcing (Fig. 6). The twentieth-century warming, however, can be explained only by anthropogenic (greenhouse gas plus sulphate aerosol) forcing. Crowley’s model prediction underpredicts the observed cooling of the late nineteenth century, which may arise from albedo changes associated with anthropogenic land-cover changes which are not incorporated in his analysis (see Mann 2000). Equally importantly, Crowley shows that the spectrum of the residuals (i.e. the remaining component after this forced variability is accounted for) agrees almost precisely with that of unforced variability from control runs of coupled models, reinforcing the notion that coupled ocean–atmosphere climate models used for ‘fingerprint detection’ of anthropogenic climate change (i.e. Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change 1996) provide reasonable estimates of the amplitude of unforced variability.

Waple et al. (2000), furthermore, find compelling similarities between the results of experiments with a coupled model forced with estimated solar irradiance variations in past centuries (Cubasch et al. 1997) and the spatial patterns of correlation between empirical temperature reconstructions and reconstructions of solar radiative forcing during the period 1650–1850 preceding the apparent emergence of an anthropogenic climate change signal (i.e. Mann et al. 1998). A coupling of solar forcing to the intrinsic multidecadal North Atlantic mode discussed earlier is found in both the empirical and model-based analyses. Enhanced temperature anomalies in certain regions of the North Atlantic (e.g. the relatively more pronounced European Little Ice Age and Medieval Warm Period) could, as discussed earlier, represent a regional pattern resulting from ocean circulation changes. Thus, it is possible (e.g. Mann 2000) that such regional anomalies are synchronised with the more modest hemispheric warming and cooling because both
represent possible hemispheric and spatial responses, respectively, to the same solar radiative forcing changes.

Conclusions

The latest assessments of past large-scale climate variability from palaeoclimatic indicators provide a key perspective regarding climate variability and climate change during the twentieth century. Such assessments show, for example, that late twentieth-century temperatures are probably unprecedented in at least a millennium, at hemispheric or global scales. Proxy evidence also provide important insights into regional patterns of climate change, including natural phenomena such as ENSO.

If defined as large-scale climate anomalies, the Little Ice Age and Medieval Warm Period represent relatively modest changes in hemispheric mean temperature of less than 1 degC peak to peak in amplitude, with slightly greater estimates from borehole data apparently explainable in terms of the effects of anthropogenic land-use changes on these estimates. Temperature anomalies of considerably greater amplitude occur in particular regions, but tend to cancel in a hemispheric average. An NAO or related North Atlantic overturn may have enhanced warmth and cold regionally during the European Medieval Warm Period and Little Ice Age, respectively. It is likely that significant natural and forced changes in ENSO, NAO, and multidecadal and longer-term patterns of climate variability are superimposed on any hemispheric or global mean temperature changes, potentially explaining both the temporal and spatial details of global climate variability during the past millennium. Empirical studies employing expanded networks of proxy climate indicators, and more spatially detailed model-based studies of forced climate variability in past centuries should help to elucidate these details.

Acknowledgements

The paper benefited from valuable collaborations and/or discussions with a large number of individuals, including R. S. Bradley, K. Briffa, W. Broecker, M. Cane, E. Cook, T. Crowley, H. Cullen, R. D'Arrigo, T. Delworth, M. K. Hughes, P. D. Jones, T. Osborn, J. T. Overpeck, J. Mahlman, H. Pollack and A. Waple, as well as the very thoughtful comments of two anonymous reviewers. The author acknowledges support from NOAA and NSF through the Earth Systems History Program.

References

Bradley, R. S. and Jones, P. D. (1993) 'Little Ice Age' summer temperature variations: their nature and relevance to recent global warming trends. Holocene, 3, pp. 367–376
Cullen, H., D'Arrigo, R., Cook, E. and Mann, M. E.
--- (1999) Northern Hemisphere temperatures

---


Thompson, L. G. (1996) Climate changes for the last 200 years inferred from ice core evidence in tropical ice core. In: Jones, P. D., Bradley, R. S. and Jouzel, J. (Eds) *Climate variations and forcing mechanisms of the last 200 years*. NATO ASI Series I,
Fig. 1 Northern Hemisphere mean annual temperature reconstruction (AD 1000–1980) and instrumental series (1902–99) (from Mann et al. 1999). The shaded band indicates 95% confidence limits. Note that uncertainties increase back in time. The figure has been updated from Mann et al. (1999) to reflect a modest correction of the 1998 value, and to update the instrumental record to 1999.

Fig. 2 Northern Hemisphere temperature reconstructions of Mann et al. (1998, 1999), Briffa et al. (1998), and Jones et al. (1998), along with recent instrumental record (Jones et al. 1999), smoothed to highlight variations on time-scales greater than 40 years. The 2 standard error uncertainty range for the Mann et al. reconstruction is shown by the shaded region.

Fig. 3 Comparison of smoothed Mann et al. Northern Hemisphere mean (smoothed as in Fig. 2) and Northern Hemisphere terrestrial mean (both smoothed and raw annual mean values) temperature reconstruction with borehole Northern Hemisphere terrestrial mean temperature estimates. The dashed lines represent adjusted versions of the borehole series corresponding to the assumption that 0.6°C (top), 0.4°C (second from top, bold), and 0.2°C (second from bottom) of the warming recorded by the boreholes over the past two centuries is due to land-use changes, while the lowest dashed line corresponds to the unadjusted borehole estimates.

Fig. 4 1816 Spatial temperature anomaly (degC) patterns from Mann et al. reconstructions showing distinction between seasonal and annual patterns (from Mann et al. 2000b) (© American Meteorological Society).

Fig. 5 Cold-season Niño3 temperature index reconstruction (AD 1650–1980) and instrumental series (1902–98) (from Mann et al. 2000b). The shaded band indicates 95% confidence limits for the Niño3 reconstruction. The Southern Oscillation Index (SOI) reconstruction has been rescaled to have the same sign and the same standard deviation as the Niño3 reconstruction; the two reconstructions, based on independent methods and partially independent data, have a linear correlation of 0.64 during the pre-calibration interval of mutual overlap (1707–1901). The magnitude of the 1997/98 event is shown for comparison.

Fig. 6 Comparison of empirical and energy balance model (EBM) estimated millennial changes in Northern Hemisphere annual mean temperatures during the past millennium, smoothed to highlight variations on time-scales greater than 40 years. The 2 standard error uncertainty range for the Mann et al. reconstruction is shown by the shaded region.
- Mann et al reconstruction (entire N. Hem.; smoothed)
- 1961–1990 mean (instrumental record)
- instrumental series (entire N. Hem.; smoothed)
- Mann et al reconstruction (N.Hem extratropical land only; smoothed)
- - Huang et al terrestrial mean N. Hem borehole estimates